

Title: Historical Research in Music Education and Music Therapy: A Quarter-Century of Research, Writing, and Publication

Author(s): George N. Heller

Source: Heller, G. N. (1992, Spring). Historical research in music education and music therapy: A quarter-century of research, writing, and publication. *The Quarterly*, 3(1), pp. 56-62. (Reprinted with permission in *Visions of Research in Music Education*, 16(3), Autumn, 2010). Retrieved from <http://www-usr.rider.edu/~vrme/>

It is with pleasure that we inaugurate the reprint of the entire seven volumes of The Quarterly Journal of Music Teaching and Learning. The journal began in 1990 as The Quarterly. In 1992, with volume 3, the name changed to The Quarterly Journal of Music Teaching and Learning and continued until 1997. The journal contained articles on issues that were timely when they appeared and are now important for their historical relevance. For many authors, it was their first major publication. Visions of Research in Music Education will publish facsimiles of each issue as it originally appeared. Each article will be a separate pdf file. Jason D. Vodicka has accepted my invitation to serve as guest editor for the reprint project and will compose a new editorial to introduce each volume. Chad Keilman is the production manager. I express deepest thanks to Richard Colwell for granting VRME permission to re-publish The Quarterly in online format. He has graciously prepared an introduction to the reprint series.

Historical Research In Music Education And Music Therapy: A Quarter-Century Of Research, Writing, And Publication

By George N. Heller

The University of Kansas

Scholars interested in historical research in music education and music therapy in the 25-year period from 1967 to 1991 have seen many significant changes. Historical research in music education went through a period of decline and then growth, while historical research in music therapy went from virtually nothing to a little something. As things now stand, research activities in both areas are at something of a crossroads, if not a crisis. The future looks reasonably bright, but the course is anything but clear.

In the past 25 years, music education and music therapy historians have produced books, journal articles, and doctoral dissertations. Many budding historians have written masters' theses during this time, but indexing of these is so haphazard as to forego their being included in this essay. Along the way, research method books have generally contained some small amount of material on historical research. Though they may have run anywhere from ten to twenty or more chapters, none gave more than a single chapter to the special problems of historical research, writing, and dissemination.

In 1967, the only book dedicated exclusively to the history of music education was Edward Bailey Birge's *History of Public School Music in the United States*, written in 1928, revised in 1937, and reprinted in 1966.¹

George N. Heller is Professor in the Department of Art and Music Education and Music Therapy at the University of Kansas.

The first half, which treats the history of music education prior to 1900, was based largely on secondary sources. Much of Birge's text on the first third of the twentieth century was taken from first-hand information, as he was a direct participant in many of the activities about which he wrote. In many ways, Birge's work remains without peer, though several would-be replacements have appeared in the past 25 years. Despite its limitations, this remains an important book for historians of music education.

In the 1970s, six book-length treatments of music education history topics were published: three in 1971, one in 1975, one in 1976, and one in 1978. Lloyd F. Sunderman in 1971 expanded his doctoral dissertation into an attempt to update Birge; this project was a modest success. During the same year, A. Theodore Tellstrom wrote a book based on his doctoral dissertation attempting to trace the philosophical history of music education in the United States, also with modest results.²

In the early to mid-1970s, Frederick Fay Swift wrote and published two books on music education history that make interesting reading for those with regional interest in music in and around New York State. In 1971, Swift produced a biography of James Baxter (1819-1897), and in 1975 he wrote and published a history of the New York State Music Association. This latter book is an important contribution to the growing literature on state music education associations. Because so many of these were founded in

the late 1930s and early 1940s, many have recently celebrated or will soon celebrate their fiftieth anniversaries.³

More promising work has come from editors and compilers of biographical essays and articles. The English writer Kenneth Simpson edited a collection of essays on European music educators, many of whom have had considerable impact on American theory and practice. Lemuel Berry, Jr., made a much-needed contribution with his collection of articles on African-American musicians and music educators.⁴

Books written in the 1980s were somewhat better, though music educators could still not dismiss Birge entirely. In 1982, James A. Keene made yet another run at the master with better success than either Sunderman or Tellstrom. While an important contribution to the literature in many respects, Keene's book has some significant weaknesses and omissions. Michael L. Mark, on the other hand, made an important contribution in 1982 with his collection of source readings. This much-needed work brought primary sources within easy reach of music education historians. A third book in 1982 was a major disappointment, however; A. Harold Goodman's miniature history and collection of biographies did little to advance the cause of music education history.⁵

Carol A. Pemberton, erstwhile biographer of Lowell Mason, brought out two books on her favorite topic in the 1980s. The first, in 1985, is a revised version of her 1971 dissertation and a fascinating full-length biography of "The Father of Public School Music. The Founder of American Protestant Hymnody. Empire Builder. The First American to Make a Fortune as a Musician. The Head of a Musical Dynasty. Founder of American National Music" (p. ix). In 1988, Pemberton brought out a bio-bibliography on Mason. This will prove to be an invaluable reference tool, es-

pecially during the 1992 Mason bicentennial.⁶

The *Music Educators Journal* and its predecessor publications, the *Music Supervisors Bulletin* and the *Music Supervisors Journal* have long been important sources for music education historians. Until recently, no comprehensive index, save the year-end compilations have been available to help researchers. In 1987, Arne J. Arneson brought out a cumulative index to the *MEJ* (and *MSB* and *MSJ*) which solved this problem. Arneson's book lists articles alphabetically by author and subject and includes a list of book reviews listed alphabetically by author of the book being reviewed.⁷

Music in higher education gained the attention of music education historians in the 1980s. Several major schools celebrated centennials in that decade, leading many of them to commission histories. Most of these were in-house publications extolling the virtues and ignoring the shortcomings of the institutions, but they had the advantage of being written by scholars who knew the institutions at first hand and had convenient access to the sources. In 1988, the College Music Society sponsored the publication of Edward Brookhart's very

helpful bibliography of books, articles, dissertations, and theses on the history of music in American colleges and universities.⁸

In the mid to late 1980s, two histories of state music education activities were published. In 1985, Marvin S. Thostenson added to the literature on state music education with his history of the Iowa State Music Teachers Association. In 1987, James A. Keene contributed to the state literature with the publication of his doctoral dissertation on music and music education in Vermont.⁹

In the late 1980s and early 1990s, Bernarr Rainbow and the Boethius Press in Aberystwyth, Wales, brought out a series of books containing narrative histories of music

"If one were to search for a phrase to describe the present status and future prospects of historical research in music education . . . that phrase might be guarded optimism."

education in Great Britain and reprints of important primary sources. Rainbow's work is thorough and scholarly, though much of it is unknown to American audiences. He relies heavily on primary sources, many of which are reproduced in whole or in part as integral sections of historical narratives or as self-contained works. Of particularly high quality is Rainbow's *Music in Educational Thought and Practice*, which surveys music education in Europe from 800 BC through the 1960s.¹⁰

The most recent contribution to state music education history is Joseph D. Parker's history of the Kentucky Music Educators Association. Mildred M. Berkey, KMEA archivist and historian and a past president of the association, and William M. Bigham, also a past president of the association, edited Parker's dissertation and helped the association publish it. The work of the author and two editors is a good example of historical research at the state and local level. It shows the lengths to which concerned individuals will go to make such histories available. Their work also serves as a model for other similar projects in state and local history.¹¹

It is dangerous to draw conclusions from limited evidence, but it appears safe to say that much more could and should be done on this history of music education and music therapy. Because comprehensive histories of music education have had at best only moderate success, Allen Britton's comment on the nature and difficulty of this task may still be valid. In 1959, he wrote that "no general history of music education has yet been written, nor can one be written soon because the necessary special monographs are small in number and cover only a few, and to a large extent, unrelated areas."¹² The studies he called for some 32 years ago are beginning to appear in ever-increasing numbers, but authors and commentators are not yet relating them one to another. This step must precede the grand synthesis of which Britton wrote.

It may be noted that not a single one of the books mentioned here was concerned with music therapy. What little music therapy history has been done in the past 25 years may be found in works devoted to other topics. Some historical information on music therapy appears either in books on music therapy in

general, or in historical articles in professional journals and dictionaries.¹³

Biographical studies of music educators have met with some success in the past 25 years. Among the most successful are those which bring biographical information on several people together in one source. Especially noteworthy in this regard is *The New Grove Dictionary of American Music*, which contains biographical articles on numerous music educators. This is the first time editors of a music dictionary have seen fit to include significant treatment of music education and music educators in a reference tool intended for general use. Much more work of this type would be helpful to music therapists interested in understanding their field better.

In the same vein, biographical tools seem to have found a market and seem to be serving a need. Bio-bibliographies, subject-matter indexes, and indexes to major periodical publications have led the way. Much remains to be done to make the literature and primary sources of music education history accessible to casual readers and serious scholars.¹⁴

On the negative side, writers in the past 25 years have encountered problems and pitfalls trying to make books out of revised doctoral dissertations or attempting to revise Birge. Both of these avenues to publication (Carol Pemberton's work excepted) have met with considerable difficulty. Keene's partial success may, however, be a harbinger of better things to come. The soon-to-be-published contribution of Michael L. Mark and Charles L. Gary may be what music education historians have been looking for in a comprehensive treatment of their favorite subject.¹⁵

David McGuire has put forth a unique contribution to music education history. His *MUS-ED-Graphs*, first published in 1985 and revised in 1990 rather defies categorization. McGuire's graphs show ideas, events, publications, compositions, and movements associated with the history of music education in the United States. He has assembled background information from the fields of music history, popular music, world history, science and technology, education, and politics. McGuire presents all this in five parts: (1) Religious Motive, 1620-1776; (2) Political-Eco-

nomic Motive, 1776-1865; (3) Utilitarian Motive, 1865-1920; (4) Mass-Education Motive, 1920-1957; and (5) Technological Motive, 1957-present.¹⁶

Persons interested in research in music education for the past 25 years have been very much concerned with methods and techniques. Consequently a number of so-called research method books have appeared in the period from 1969 to 1987, and another is in press. Three came on the market in quick succession in 1968, 1969, and 1970. One of these was revised in 1980 and again

in 1986, and a new work appeared in 1987.

Neal Glenn at the University of Iowa and Edgar M. Turrentine at the University of Minnesota brought out their book, *Introduction to Advanced Study in Music Education*, in 1968. Glenn and Turrentine attempted a multi-purpose book to serve as a text in an introduction to graduate study in music education. The first section contains readings from Plato, Aristotle, Saint Augustine, Martin Luther, and so forth. The second section discusses research in music education. The third expounds on scientific research and

Table 1. Journal Articles on Historical Topics in Music Education.

	Biographies	Geographies	Other	Total
1967-71	5	6	7	18
1972-76	14	3	18	35
1977-81	15	5	30	50
1982-86	38	21	62	121
1987-91	50	26	60	136
TOTAL	122	61	177	360

Table 2. Journal Articles on Historical Topics in Music Therapy.

	Biographies	Geographies	Other	Total
1967-71	0	0	0	0
1972-76	0	0	1	1
1977-81	1	0	1	2
1982-86	1	0	5	6
1987-91	1	1	2	4
TOTAL	3	1	9	13

Table 3. Doctoral Dissertations on Historical Topics in Music Education.

	Biographies	Geographies	Other	Total
1967-71	24	51	43	118
1972-76	34	45	27	106
1977-81	11	16	8	35
1982-86	17	19	15	51
1987-91	28	16	15	59
TOTAL	114	147	108	369

bibliographic techniques. The authors presented historical research techniques as one of several designs (the others are descriptive-survey, experimental, and case study).¹⁷

Roger Phelps followed Glenn and Turrentine in 1969 with his book, *A Guide to Research in Music Education*. Like Glenn and Turrentine, Phelps put historical research in tandem with social science research and with philosophical inquiry. His book emphasized methodology and design of research projects in keeping with the scientific trend of the times. Phelps's chapter on historical research is much more detailed than anything else available at that time. He gave a clear and cogent rationale for historical research and suggested some procedures for carrying it out. The emphasis is on research methods throughout. He had very little to say on the problems of effective narrative writing. Subsequent revisions in 1980 and 1986 made very few changes in the sections on historical research.¹⁸

In 1987, Edward L. Rainbow and Hildegard C. Froehlich of North Texas State University (now the University of North Texas) brought out a new music education research methods book. Written mainly for graduate students, the book was aimed at both researchers and consumers of research. Rainbow and Froehlich also tried to explain what research is and why it is done as well as to show how it is done. Their chapter on historical research summarizes current ideas well, though its enthusiasm for oral history, psychohistory, and quantitative history may seem excessive to those who are familiar with the topics and approaches commonly found in the field. Oral history has been used to some extent, but psychohistory and quantitative history techniques are rarely applied to music education.¹⁹

Periodical literature in music education and music therapy has increased dramatically in the past 25 years. Of 360 articles listed in *Historical Research in Music Education: A Bibliography* (1991), 18 were published in 1967-1971; 35 in 1972-76; 50 in 1977-81; 121 in 1982-86; and 135 in 1987-91. Gains were registered in the three categories of biographical studies, geographical studies, and topics primarily concerned with matters other than persons or places. For the years 1967-1991,

about one-third of all studies were biographical, about one-sixth were geographical, and nearly one-half were "other" (see Table 1).

The situation with periodical literature in music therapy is, unfortunately, much easier to deal with. In the period 1967 to 1991, a total of 13 articles concerned with or reporting historical research in music therapy appeared. Of these, none appeared in 1967-71, one in 1972-76, six in 1982-86, and four in 1987-91. For the period 1967-91, three biographical articles appeared, one was geographical, and nine were "other" (see Table 2).²⁰

A tabulation of 369 doctoral dissertations in music education and music therapy reveals declines in all areas in the late 1960s and throughout the 1970s. The numbers have come back up slightly in the 1980s and early 1990s. Doctoral students wrote 118 historical dissertations on music education topics in 1967-71, 106 in 1972-76, 35 in 1977-81, 51 in 1982-86, and 59 in 1987-91. This pattern may be attributable to declines in numbers of doctoral students in music, or it may reflect an increasing interest in descriptive and experimental research among doctoral students and their advisors in music education (see Table 3).²¹

Music therapy dissertations from 1967 to 1991, like music therapy journal articles, are much easier to account for. Four doctoral students in music therapy chose to write dissertations on historical topics during the past 25 years: William B. Davis, on selected music therapy literature of the nineteenth century; Robert E. Johnson, a biography of E. Thayer Gaston; Fred G. Kersten on methods and materials for visually-impaired students; and Alan L. Solomon on the National Association for Music Therapy.²²

If one were to search for a phrase to describe the present status and future prospects of historical research in music education and music therapy in light of what has happened over the past 25 years, that phrase might be guarded optimism. While publications of historical research seem to be on the increase, the production of doctoral dissertations (which are the training exercises of historians and often the source of books and articles) are rising slightly after a period of severe decline. Music education appears to be in reasonably

good shape, while music therapy has yet to make a substantial beginning on documenting and reporting its history.

Research that is done in the next 25 years will undoubtedly have to deal with current trends in history and historical writing. Historians in related fields are debating the issues of revisionism, relativism, and political correctness with considerable passion, and it seems unlikely that music education and music therapy historians can continue to ignore these concerns. Psychohistory, oral history, and quantitative history have had small influence on music education and music therapy history, and that is not likely to continue.

Synthesis is still needed. The time may be fast approaching for music education historians to attempt large overviews and broader themes than they have tackled in the past. To do so, they (and their doctoral dissertation advisors) have to become more concerned with philosophical methods and narrative techniques than they have been to date. Attention to perspectives, contexts, and stories may have to rise to the same level of concern as is presently accorded to primary sources and verification of evidence. Music therapy historians still lack so much basic research as to make a synthesis impossible at this time.


All historians continue to benefit from improved indexing, bibliographic tools, and various technological devices which improve access to literature and sources. Work in this area is just beginning, but the tools now becoming available show much promise. Future researchers will have the benefit of these products of dedicated workers who foresee the needs accurately.

Publication and dissemination of historical research in music education and music therapy is improving. More books and articles are out than ever before. While this creates work for compilers of new indexes and bibliographic tools, it also helps bring the knowledge of the past to light. Publication and dissemination of historical research are the *sine qua non* to progress in the field. Doing research is necessary, but it is not sufficient; the stories and documents must be available to the community of scholars and to others interested in historical research in

music education and music therapy. Research, writing, and publication are all essential to the task.

Notes

1. Edward Bailey Birge, *History of Public School Music in the United States* (Boston: Oliver Ditson Company, 1928). See also the "New and Augmented Edition" (Bryn Mawr, PA: Oliver Ditson Company, 1937), and reprint ed. (Washington, DC: Music Educators National Conference, 1966).
2. Lloyd F. Sunderman, *Historical Foundations of Music Education in the United States* (Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, 1971); and A. Theodore Tellstrom, *Music in American Education: Past and Present* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1971).
3. Frederick Fay Swift, *James Baxter: An American Pioneer Music Educator* (Oneonta, NY: Swift-Dorr Publications, 1971); and Frederick Fay Swift, *A History of the New York State School Music Association, 1932-1975* (Oneonta, NY: Swift-Dorr Publications Inc., 1975).
4. Kenneth Simpson, ed., *Some Great Music Educators: A Collection of Essays* (Borough, Kent, England: Novello & Company, Ltd., 1976); and Lemuel Berry, Jr., ed., *Biographical Dictionary of Black Musicians and Music Educators* (Guthrie, OK: Educational Book Publishers, 1978).
5. James A. Keene, *A History of Music Education in the United States* (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1982); Michael L. Mark, ed., *Source Readings in Music Education History* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1982); and A. Harold Goodman, *Music Education: Perspectives and Perceptions* (Dubuque, IA: Kendall-Hunt Publishing Company, 1982).
6. Carol A. Pemberton, *Lowell Mason: His Life and Work* (Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research Press, 1985); and Carol A. Pemberton, *Lowell Mason: A Bio-Bibliography* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1988).
7. Arne Jon Arneson, *The Music Educators Journal: Cumulative Index, 1914-1987* (Stevens Point, WI: Index House, 1987).
8. Edward Brookhart, *Music in American Higher Education* (Detroit, MI: Harmonie Park Press, 1988). A very incomplete list of books on music in specific institutions would include J. Bunker Clark, *Music at KU: A History of the University of Kansas Music Department* (Lawrence, KS: The University of Kansas, 1986); Judith Kogan, *Nothing But the Best: The Struggle for Perfection at the Juilliard School*, reprint ed. (New York: Limelight Editions, 1989); and *100 Years of Music at Michigan, 1880-1980* (Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan, 1979). This last features an excellent essay by Richard Crawford, "Music at Michigan: A Historical Perspective," pp. 9-38.
9. Marvin S. Thostenson, *A History of the First Century of the Iowa Music Teachers Association, 1885-1985* (Iowa City, IA: Iowa Music Teachers Association, 1985); and James A. Keene, *Music and Education in Vermont, 1700-1900* (Macomb, IL: Glenbridge Publishing Ltd., 1987).
10. Bernarr Rainbow, *Music in Educational Thought and Practice* (Aberystwyth, Wales: Boethius Press, 1989). See also John Curwen, *The Teacher's Manual of the Tonic Sol-Fa Method*, tenth ed. (London: J. Curwen & Sons, Ltd., 1875), reprint ed. with an introduction by

- Bernarr Rainbow (Kilkenny, Ireland: Boethius Press, 1986); and Bernarr Rainbow, ed., *Music and the English Public School* (Aberystwyth, Wales: Boethius Press, 1990).
11. Joseph D. Parker, *A History of the Kentucky Music Educators Association, 1907-1981*. Edited by Mildred M. Berkey and William M. Bigham. Louisville, KY: Kentucky Music Educators Association, 1991.
 12. Allen P. Britton, "Music in Early American Public Education: A Historical Critique," in *Basic Concepts in Music Education, the Fifty-Seventh Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education*, ed. Nelson B. Henry (Chicago: National Society for the Study of Education, 1958), 196.
 13. For an example of a dictionary article containing a good historical overview of music therapy, see *The New Grove Dictionary of American Music*, s.v. "Music Therapy," by George L. Duerksen.
 14. Two very recent additions to this literature are George N. Heller, *Historical Research in Music Education: A Bibliography* (Lawrence, KS: The University of Kansas, 1991); and George N. Heller and Alan L. Solomon, *Historical Research in Music Therapy: A Bibliography* (Lawrence, KS: The University of Kansas, 1991).
 15. Michael L. Mark and Charles L. Gary, *A History of American Music Education* (New York: Schirmer Books, in press).
 16. David McGuire, *MUS-ED Graphs* (Denton, TX: MUS-ED-Graphs, 1990).
 17. Neal E. Glenn and Edgar M. Turrentine, *Introduction to Advanced Study in Music Education* (Dubuque, IA: Wm. C. Brown Company Publishers, 1968).
 18. Roger P. Phelps, *A Guide to Research in Music Education* (Dubuque, IA: Wm. C. Brown Company Publishers, 1969); second edition (Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1980); and third edition (Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1986).
 19. Edward L. Rainbow and Hildegard C. Froehlich, *Research in Music Education: An Introduction to Systematic Inquiry* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1987).
 20. Data for music therapy publications comes from Heller and Solomon, *Historical Research in Music Therapy*.
 21. Data taken from Heller, *Historical Research in Music Education*.
 22. William B. Davis, "An Analysis of Selected Nineteenth-Century Music Therapy Literature" (Ph.D. diss., The University of Kansas, 1984); Robert E. Johnson, "E. Thayer Gaston: Contributions to Music Therapy and Music Education" (Ph.D. diss., The University of Michigan, 1973); Fred G. Kersten, "An Analysis of Music Education Methods and Materials for the Visually Impaired Synthesized from Documents Written Between 1891 and 1978" (Ed.D. diss., The Pennsylvania State University, 1979); Alan L. Solomon, "A Historical Study of the National Association for Music Therapy, 1960-1980" (Ph.D. diss., The University of Kansas, 1984). 

Contributions to Music Education

John Kratus, Editor

Fall 1991, Number 18

Music Educators' Personality Types as Measured by the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator--Thomas M. Wubbenhorst

Relationships Between Teacher Personality and Ratings of Applied Music Teaching Behavior--Charles P. Schmidt, Barbara E. Lewis, and Mary Jane Kurplus-Brock

Arts Experiences and Creativity Scores of High School Students--Donald L. Hamann, Richard Bourassa, and Mark Aderman

Attitudes of Instrumental Music Teachers Toward Multicultural Music in the Instrumental Program--Terese M. Volk

Factors Contributing to High School Band Students' Ratings at Solo and Ensemble Festival--Donald L. Hamann and Suzanne Banister

Some Unanswered Questions in Music Preference Research--Albert LeBlanc

Abstracts of Selected Posters Presented at the 1991 Ohio Music Education Association Professional Conference

Resources

Contributions to Music Education is published by the Ohio Music Education Association in recognition of the importance of research in guiding educational practice. For more information, contact Contributions to Music Education, Department of Music, Case Western University, Cleveland, OH 44106-7105.